

18A Worple Road, Epsom, Surrey, KT18 5EF

Proposed demolition of existing single storey side extension. Proposed construction of two storey rear extension, part-first floor side extension, and single storey side and rear extension.

Ward:	Town
Contact Officer:	Charlotte Nimmo

1 Plans and Representations

- 1.1 The Council now holds this information electronically. Please click on the following link to access the plans and representations relating to this application via the Council's website, which is provided by way of background information to the report. Please note that the link is current at the time of publication, and will not be updated.

Link: <http://eplanning.epsom-ewell.gov.uk/online-applications/applicationDetails.do?activeTab=documents&keyVal=OIHNA7GY08I00>

2 Summary

- 2.1 The application seeks permission for the construction of extensions to a residential property within a designated conservation area.
- 2.2 This application has been submitted to committee at the request of Cllr Tella Wormington.
- 2.3 The application is recommended for APPROVAL**

3 Site description

- 3.1 The application site comprises a residential corner plot located at the junction of Heathcote Road, Downside and Worple Road, facing south east across the Worple Road Conservation Area. The site includes a protected Magnolia tree, TPO ref. 146/T3, located at the front of the dwelling.
- 3.2 The north east and part of the south east and south west elevations are considered to form the principal views of the dwelling within the conservation area. The dwelling is a two storey detached house which features a simple gabled roof. The property benefits from two single storey side extensions incorporating a double garage.
- 3.3 Members may recall that an earlier application for planning permission (15/01234/FLH) was refused, and the following appeal dismissed in August 2016, for the construction of a two storey side and rear extension incorporating a residential annexe and additional loft conversion.

4 Proposal

- 4.1 The application seeks permission for the construction of a two storey rear extension, first floor side extension, and single storey side and rear extension (to replace an existing side extension). Revised plans for the scheme were accepted on 24 March 2017.
- 4.2 No alterations to the existing double garage or garden amenity space are proposed.

5 Comments from third parties

- 5.1 The application was advertised by means of letters of notification to 11 neighbouring properties, and a site notice. To date (01.06.2017) 3 letters of objection have been received from residents regarding:
- 'Huge improvement' on previous scheme
 - Importance of matching materials
 - Adverse impact on character and appearance of surrounding area (relating to original scheme)
 - Loss of privacy from side window of first floor extension (relating to original plans submitted)
 - Loss of light from first floor extension (relating to revised plans)
 - Overlooking from first floor extension (relating to revised plans)
- 5.2 Epsom Civic Society have commented once on each set of plans:
- January 2017: The scheme is an improvement on the previous proposal as it attempts to retain the original elevation to Worple Road. The elevation to Heathcote Road would result in a haphazard appearance as a result of the incoherent and independent extensions. The Society holds the view that the work would cause harm to the building and the conservation area and the application should be refused,
 - March 2017: The revised plans do little to alleviate the problems previously raised and the revised scheme is believed to still cause harm to the building and the conservation area.

6 Consultations

- 6.1 Design and Conservation Officer: There is no repetitive pattern nor a prevailing architectural form or style at this point in the street scene. A sympathetic alteration is therefore unlikely to harm either the eclectic character of the street scene or the significance of the designated area as a whole. Due to its prominent corner location, three of the four elevations of the host dwelling have a strong presence in the street scenes of both Worple Road and Heathcote Road. It is therefore essential for any new work to make a positive contribution to the two streetscapes so that key qualities of both the Worple Road and Church Street conservation areas remain unharmed. The proposed envelope and simple, gabled roofscape of the side addition achieve a reasonably balanced relationship with the host dwelling. However, it is preferable for the first floor side extension to be attached to the northern façade (Heathcote Road) to avoid crowding the neighbouring dwelling.
- 6.2 In the amended form there is no objection to the proposed two storey rear addition, as it remains subordinate to the host dwelling and the existing elevational hierarchy is unaffected. There would be no objection to a modest single storey side or rear extension. However, the single storey element must be contained to the rear of the host dwelling and the presently proposed 'wrap around' effect entirely avoided.
- 6.3 Addendum to comments above, dated 10 May 2017: The ensuing harm is far from the level which justifies refusal in terms of para. 133 of the NPPF. Where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, para. 134 advises that the harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing its optimum viable use. It is therefore recommended that an 'on-balance' planning decision be made in this case.

7 Relevant planning history

- 7.1 15/01234/FLH: Two-storey side and rear extension, incorporating the creation of a residential annexe. Loft conversion. (Description amended 11.01.2016 and amended drawings received 21.01.2016) (Description amended 25.01.2016). REFUSED by Committee. Appeal dismissed August 2016.
- 7.2 16/01080/FLH: Demolish single storey side extension and erect 2-storey side and rear and part single storey side extensions. WITHDRAWN as invalid

8 Planning Policy

Core Strategy 2007

Policy CS1	General Policy
Policy CS5	Built Environment

Development Management Policies Document 2015

Policy DM5	Trees and Landscape
Policy DM8	Heritage Assets

Policy DM9	Townscape Character and Local Distinctiveness
Policy DM10	Design Requirements for New Developments
Policy DM37	Parking Standards

Supplementary Planning Guidance

Householder Design Guidance 2004

Parking Standards for Residential Development 2015

9 Planning considerations

Previous Application

9.1 A previous application (15/01234/FLH) for the construction of a two storey side and rear extension, incorporating the creation of a residential annexe, and loft conversion was refused by the Committee in February 2016 on the following grounds:

- The bulk and form of the proposed extensions would have a serious adverse impact on the character and appearance of the surrounding area, situated within the Church Street and Worple Road Conservation Areas. The proposal would therefore conflict with Policies DM8, DM9 and DM10 of the Development Management Policies Document - September 2015 and Policy CS5 of the Core Strategy 2007.

This decision was upheld by the Planning Inspectorate at appeal in August 2016

9.2 This application seeks to address the previous reason for refusal in the following ways:

- The revised scheme has no additions to the main roof slopes to maintain the original character of the property
- The extensions are contained to the southern/south west corner of the site to reduce the overall impact on visual and neighbour amenities

Impact on visual amenity

9.3 Policies DM8 and DM9 of the Development Management Policies Document 2015 relate to the distinctiveness of the designated Worple Road Conservation Area, and the ways in which the Council can maintain and enhance the local character of this heritage asset through new development. Policy DM9 states that planning permission will be granted where proposals positively contribute to the visual amenities of the Borough, considering specifically:

- Compatibility with local character and the relationship to the existing townscape and wider landscape;
- The surrounding historic and natural environment;
- The setting of the proposal site and its connection to its surroundings; and

- The inclusion of locally distinctive features and use of appropriate materials
- 9.4 Additionally, section 3.9 of the supporting text to Policy DM9 states that 'new development should enhance and complement local character, and be capable of integrating well into existing areas'. The Worple Road Conservation Area map shows that the applicant property is considered a 'positive' building but is not a focal point of any important views within the area.
- 9.5 Part of Policy DM10 of the Development Management Policies Document 2015 is also relevant with regard to good design principles. The policy states that local character and distinctiveness can be identified through several elements which must be respected, maintained or enhanced through development, including:
- Scale, layout, height, form (including roof forms), massing;
 - Plot width and format which includes spaces between buildings;
 - Typical details and key features such as roof forms, window format, building materials and design detailing of elevations, existence of grass verges etc.
- 9.6 The applicant has greatly revised the previously refused scheme and amended the current application to reflect comments on the works proposed. The proposed extensions will ensure the retention of the existing simple gable roof form of the dwelling and the parapet detail topping the existing flat roofed single storey side extensions; this will maintain the principal locally distinctive features of the dwelling.
- 9.7 Additionally, the two storey elements of the work will remain subservient to the principal roof through lower gabled roof profiles, and the first floor side extension will be set back 0.9m from the front elevation of the dwelling. This ensures the original building design and height is respected as the two extensions will form a modest bulk to the less visible south west flank. Large trees and shrubs along the shared boundary with No. 20 Worple Road, in addition to the protected Magnolia on site, will go some way towards screening the proposed first floor side extension from view.
- 9.8 To the rear, the two storey extension will sit pleasantly behind the dwelling and will again be partially screened by a large tree on the north east site boundary. The relationship between the dwelling and its neighbour No. 20 will remain unchanged as there is no clear viewing gap into the conservation area between the two properties when viewed from Heathcote Road. The extensions will therefore have a limited impact on the existing relationship of this dwelling with its neighbours in the street scene.

- 9.9 The single storey extension to the side and rear, along the north east flank elevation, are unlikely to impact the local character of the area. The side element visible from the front will exactly replace the existing extension, and the work to the rear is unlikely to be visible from the public realm in Heathcote Road. There will also be some natural screening from the boundary line tree as mentioned above.
- 9.10 It is considered that the works will blend well within the eclectic street scene and character along Worple Road, and will be sufficiently screened by large tree or shrub specimens to reduce the visual impact along Heathcote Road. The two key features of the simple dwelling, its gable roof and parapet detailing to extensions, will be maintained to ensure this corner plot dwelling remains locally distinctive and the original building design respected.
- 9.11 Paragraph 133 of the NPPF states that planning permission should be refused where development will lead to substantial harm to or total loss of significance of a designated heritage asset. The relatively small scale of the proposed works at this dwelling will not result in any substantial harm to the qualities of the Worple Road Conservation Area, nor to the character of the dwelling, and so it is concluded that the proposal is found to comply with local policies DM8, DM9 and DM10.

Impact on residential amenity

- 9.12 Policy DM10 states that development should 'have regard to the amenities of occupants and neighbours, including in terms of privacy, outlook, sunlight/daylight, and noise and disturbance'. The supplementary planning guidance document for householder applications gives further information as to how impacts on neighbours can be actively lessened through design.
- 9.13 Two of the objections from neighbours relate to the original scheme. The points stated under section 5 of this report show which comments were specific to the original plans; it is considered that these can be disregarded following the submission of the revised plans.
- 9.14 One letter was received from the rear neighbour of the applicant, No. 1 Heathcote Road, relating to the potential loss of privacy and light from the side extension at first floor level. The site plan shows that the distance between the two properties at first floor level is approximately 24m, or 21m including the proposed two storey rear extension. During the officer's site visit, photographs from the rear first floor rooms show that the view towards this rear neighbour is obstructed by trees and shrubs at the shared boundary; direct overlooking into habitable rooms would therefore be unlikely following the construction of the proposed side extension.
- 9.15 The potential loss of light is considered to be no worse than currently experienced by the residents of No. 1, and again the distance between the two properties results in the strong likelihood that the side extension will not cause adverse impact to neighbouring amenities.

- 9.16 The closest neighbouring property, No. 20 Worple Road, is a flat conversion and is set slightly behind the applicant property No. 18A. There is a distance of 1m to the shared boundary from No. 18A, and a distance of approximately 5m between the dwellings themselves. The addition of the side extension at first floor level is not considered to adversely impact the neighbouring property as there will be no flank windows to the extension, following the supplementary planning guidance.
- 9.17 It is found that the proposals will overall have minimal impact on neighbour amenities; the distance to neighbouring properties and general compliance with guidance for householder applications results in an improved scheme which is considered to comply with Policy DM10 of the Development Management Policies Document 2015.

Parking standards

- 9.18 The dwelling currently provides four bedrooms and will have a total of six under the proposed extensions. This requires a minimum of three off-street parking spaces to be provided at the property in order to comply with Borough-wide standards.
- 9.19 The proposed extensions will not affect the existing double garage or double drive; the site is found to comfortably provide four off-street parking spaces for vehicles of an average size.
- 9.20 It is considered that the proposal fully complies with Policy DM37 of the Development Management Policies Document 2015 and the Parking Standards for Residential Developments 2015 Supplementary Planning Document

Tree protection

- 9.21 The works are unlikely to affect the protected Magnolia tree located at the front of the property. However, implementation of a tree protection plan during the works would be prudent.
- 9.22 It is recommended that, to ensure full compliance with Policy DM5 of the Development Management Policies Document 2015, a condition is imposed requiring an Arboricultural Method Statement to be submitted prior to works commencing on site.

CIL

- 9.23 The original plans were calculated to increase the internal floorspace by 99.48sqm. This falls below the 100sqm threshold for CIL liability
- 9.24 The revised scheme is calculated to increase the internal floorspace by 104.79sqm. The application is therefore CIL liable

10 Conclusion

- 10.1 It is considered that the proposed construction of a two storey rear extension, part-first floor side extension, and single storey side and rear extension is acceptable as the scheme is found to comply with relevant local planning policy; it is therefore recommended that this application be APPROVED.

11 Recommendation

- 11.1 Planning permission is granted, subject to the following conditions:

Conditions

- (1) The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended by Section 51 (1) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

- (2) The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans, received on 24 March 2017: 671/10A, 671/11A, 671/12A, and 671/13A.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans to comply with Policy CS5 of the Core Strategy (2007).

- (3) The external finishes of the development hereby permitted, including making good to the retained fabric, shall match in material, colour, size, style, bonding, texture and profile those of the existing building.

Reason: To secure a satisfactory appearance in the interests of the visual amenities and character of the locality in accordance with Policy CS5 of the Core Strategy (2007) and Policies DM9 and DM10 of the Development Management Policies 2015.

- (4) Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015 (or any Order revoking or re-enacting or amending that Order with or without modification), no windows, dormer windows, rooflights, doors or other form of openings other than those shown on the approved plans, shall be inserted in any elevation of the development hereby permitted.

Reason: To safeguard the privacy of the occupants of adjoining properties in accordance with Policy DM10 of the Development Management Policies 2015.

- (5) No development shall take place until an Arboricultural Method Statement (detailing all aspects of construction and staging of works) and a Tree Protection Plan in accordance with British Standard

5837:2012 (or later revision) has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the agreed details and no equipment, machinery or materials shall be brought onto the site for the purposes of the development until fencing has been erected in accordance with the Tree Protection Plan. Within any area fenced in accordance with this condition, nothing shall be stored, placed or disposed of above or below ground, the ground level shall not be altered, no excavations shall be made, nor shall any fires be lit, without the prior written consent of the local planning authority. The fencing shall be maintained in accordance with the approved details, until all equipment, machinery and surplus materials have been moved from the site.

Reason: To protect the trees on site which are to be retained in the interests of the visual amenities of the locality in accordance with Policy CS5 of the Core Strategy (2007) and Policies DM5 and DM9 of the Development Management Policies 2015.

Informatives

- (1) The Council confirms that in assessing this planning application it has worked with the applicant in a positive and proactive way, in line with the requirements of paragraph 186-187 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2012.**
- (2) Works related to the construction of the development hereby permitted, including works of demolition or preparation prior to building operations shall not take place other than between the hours of 08.00 to 18.00 hours Mondays to Fridays; 08.00 to 13.00 hours Saturdays; with no work on Saturday afternoons (after 13.00 hours), Sundays, Bank Holidays or Public Holidays.**
- (3) If you need any advice regarding Building Regulations please do not hesitate to contact Epsom & Ewell Borough Council Building Control on 01372 732000 or contactus@epsom-ewell.gov.uk.**
- (4) This form of development is considered liable for the Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL). CIL is a non-negotiable charge on new developments which involve the creation of 100 square metres or more of gross internal floorspace or involve the creation of a new dwelling, even when this is below 100 square metres. The levy is a standardised, non-negotiable charge expressed as pounds per square metre, and are charged on the net additional floorspace generated by a development. You will receive more information regarding the CIL in due course. More information and the charging schedule are available online <http://www.epsom-ewell.gov.uk/residents/planning/planning-advice/community-infrastructure-levy-cil-guidance>**